Non-thermal fixed points

Jürgen Berges (TU Darmstadt) Alexander Rothkopf (Tokyo U.) Jonas Schmidt (DESY)

Phys. Rev. Lett., in print (2008) arXiv:0803.0131 [hep-ph]

Content

- I. Nonequilibrium functional RG/ 2PI effective action
- **II.** Non-thermal fixed points

III. Applications

- inflaton preheating dynamics
- fermion instability dynamics
- non-Abelian plasma instabilities

Nonequilibrium dynamics

Thermalization process?

Schematically:



- Characteristic nonequilibrium time scales?
- Diverging time scales far from equilibrium, described by scaling solutions?

 \rightarrow Non-thermal fixed points

Nonequilibrium vs. equilibrium

E.g. time-ordered 2-point function: $G(x,y) = \langle T_C \Phi(x)\Phi(y) \rangle - \langle \Phi(x) \rangle \langle \Phi(y) \rangle$

spectral function ~ $\langle [\Phi, \Phi] \rangle$ i.e. which states are available?

$$G(x,y) = F(x,y) - \frac{i}{2}\rho(x,y)\operatorname{sign}_{\mathscr{C}}(x^0 - y^0)$$

statistical propagator ~ $\langle \{\Phi, \Phi\} \rangle$ i.e. how often is a state occupied?

Nonequilibrium vs. equilibrium

E.g. time-ordered 2-point function: $G(x,y) = \langle T_C \Phi(x)\Phi(y) \rangle - \langle \Phi(x) \rangle \langle \Phi(y) \rangle$

spectral function ~ $\langle [\Phi, \Phi] \rangle$ i.e. which states are available?

$$G(x,y) = F(x,y) - \frac{i}{2}\rho(x,y)\operatorname{sign}_{\mathscr{C}}(x^0 - y^0)$$

statistical propagator $\sim \langle \{\Phi, \Phi\} \rangle$ i.e. how often is a state occupied?

Tremendous simplification in thermal equilibrium $G(x,y)=G^{(eq)}(x-y)$:

 $F^{(eq)}(\boldsymbol{\omega}, \mathbf{p}) = -i\left(\frac{1}{2} + n_{BE}(\boldsymbol{\omega})\right) \boldsymbol{\rho}^{(eq)}(\boldsymbol{\omega}, \mathbf{p})$ "fluctuation-dissipation relation"

Nonequilibrium vs. equilibrium

E.g. time-ordered 2-point function: $G(x,y) = \langle T_C \Phi(x)\Phi(y) \rangle - \langle \Phi(x) \rangle \langle \Phi(y) \rangle$

spectral function $\sim \langle [\Phi, \Phi] \rangle$ i.e. which states are available?

$$G(x,y) = F(x,y) - \frac{i}{2}\rho(x,y)\operatorname{sign}_{\mathscr{C}}(x^0 - y^0)$$

statistical propagator ~ $\langle \{\Phi, \Phi\} \rangle$ i.e. how often is a state occupied?

Tremendous simplification in thermal equilibrium $G(x,y)=G^{(eq)}(x-y)$:

 $F^{(eq)}(\boldsymbol{\omega}, \mathbf{p}) = -i\left(\frac{1}{2} + n_{\text{BE}}(\boldsymbol{\omega})\right) \boldsymbol{\rho}^{(eq)}(\boldsymbol{\omega}, \mathbf{p}) \quad \text{``fluctuation-dissipation relation''}$

Nonequilibrium:

$$F \not\sim \rho$$

(fermions: $F^{(f)}(x,y) = \frac{1}{2} \langle [\Psi(x), \overline{\Psi}(y)] \rangle$, $\rho^{(f)}(x,y) = i \langle \{\Psi(x), \overline{\Psi}(y)\} \rangle$)

Infrared scaling

Scaling behavior:

 $F(\omega, \mathbf{p}) = s^{2+\alpha} F(s^z \omega, s\mathbf{p})$, $\rho(\omega, \mathbf{p}) = s^{2-\eta} \rho(s^z \omega, s\mathbf{p})$

with universal critical exponents η , z and α ("occupation number exponent")

Infrared scaling

Scaling behavior:

$$F(\omega, \mathbf{p}) = s^{2+\alpha} F(s^z \omega, s\mathbf{p})$$
 , $\rho(\omega, \mathbf{p}) = s^{2-\eta} \rho(s^z \omega, s\mathbf{p})$

with universal critical exponents η , z and α ("occupation number exponent")

• Thermal equilibrium: $n_{BE}(\omega) \stackrel{\omega \ll T}{\sim} \frac{T}{\omega}$ i.e. from the fluctuation-dissipation relation $\Rightarrow \alpha - z + \eta = 0$ For relativistic 3+1d scalar theories in *equilibrium* typically:

$$z \simeq 1, \eta \simeq 0$$
 i.e. $\alpha \simeq 1$

Infrared scaling

Scaling behavior:

$$F(\omega, \mathbf{p}) = s^{2+\alpha} F(s^z \omega, s\mathbf{p})$$
 , $\rho(\omega, \mathbf{p}) = s^{2-\eta} \rho(s^z \omega, s\mathbf{p})$

with universal critical exponents η , z and α ("occupation number exponent")

• Thermal equilibrium: $n_{BE}(\omega) \stackrel{\omega \ll T}{\sim} \frac{T}{\omega}$ i.e. from the fluctuation-dissipation relation $\Rightarrow \alpha - z + \eta = 0$ For relativistic 3+1d scalar theories in *equilibrium* typically:

$$z \simeq 1, \eta \simeq 0$$
 i.e. $\alpha \simeq 1$

• Non-thermal infrared fixed point: e.g.

$$\alpha \simeq 4 (!)$$

 \rightarrow strongly enhanced infrared fluctuations

Nonperturbative descriptions

Two-particle irreducible expansions

$$\Gamma[\phi, G] = S[\phi] + \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Tr} \ln G^{-1}$$
$$+ \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Tr} G_0^{-1}(\phi) G + \Gamma_2[\phi, G]$$
$$\delta \Gamma / \delta G = 0$$

Luttinger, Ward '60; Baym '62; Cornwall, Jackiw, Tomboulis '74,...

```
2PI-1/N to NLO: (\lambda(\phi_a\phi_a)^2)
```

 $\Gamma_2[\phi,G] =$

Functional renormalization group $\Gamma_k[\phi] = \Gamma[\phi, G] + \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Tr} GR$ R = R(k): $k \frac{\partial}{\partial k} \equiv 2k^2 \frac{\partial}{\partial k^2}$ $\frac{\partial \Gamma_R[\phi]}{\partial k} = \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Tr} G \frac{\partial R}{\partial k}$ $\frac{\partial \Gamma_k}{\partial k} = \frac{1}{2}$

Wetterich '93

$$G(x,y) = F(x,y) - \frac{i}{2}\rho(x,y)\operatorname{sign}_{\mathscr{C}}(x^0 - y^0)$$

Berges '02; Aarts, Ahrensmeier, Baier, Berges, Serreau '02

Nonequilibrium proper vertices

Closed *real-time* contour (no imaginary part; $t_0 \rightarrow -\infty$ for fixed points):

$$\phi(x) = \frac{1}{2} \left(\phi^+ + \phi^- \right) \quad , \quad \tilde{\phi}(x) = \phi^+ - \phi^-$$

Nonequilibrium average action $\Gamma_k[\phi, \tilde{\phi}]$, correlators and proper vertices:

$$\Gamma_{\phi\tilde{\phi}}(x,y) \equiv \frac{\delta^2\Gamma_k[\phi,\tilde{\phi}]}{\delta\phi(x)\delta\tilde{\phi}(y)} \quad , \quad \Gamma_{\phi\tilde{\phi}\phi\phi}(x,y,z,w) \equiv \frac{\delta^4\Gamma_k[\phi,\tilde{\phi}]}{\delta\phi(x)\delta\tilde{\phi}(y)\delta\phi(z)\delta\phi(w)} \quad , \dots$$

Retarded/advanced $G^{R}(x,y) = G^{A}(y,x)$ with $\rho(x,y) = G_{R}(x,y) - G_{A}(x,y)$ and

$$G_R = -\left(\Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\phi} + R_R\right)^{-1}, \ G_A = -\left(\Gamma_{\phi\tilde{\phi}} + R_A\right)^{-1}, \ F = -i\left(\Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\phi} + R_R\right)^{-1}\Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\tilde{\phi}}\left(\Gamma_{\phi\tilde{\phi}} + R_A\right)^{-1}\right)$$
$$\left(R_R(x, y) = R_A(y, x)\right)$$

Diagrammatics



accordingly for $\partial_k \Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\tilde{\phi}\phi\phi}$ etc., all in *Minkowski space*

Diagrammatics



accordingly for $\partial_k \Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\tilde{\phi}\phi\phi}$ etc., all in *Minkowski space*

Approximations

N-component scalar theory with quartic interactions:

- classical-statistical limit
- estimate four-vertices from 2PI 1/N expansion to NLO:

• Sharp cutoff with $R_R(p) = R_A(p) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{for } p^2 \ge k^2 \\ \infty & \text{for } p^2 < k^2 \end{cases}$

 $\Rightarrow iF(p) \left[G_A(p) k \partial_k R_A(p) + G_R(p) k \partial_k R_R(p) \right] = -iF(p) 2k^2 \delta(p^2 - k^2)$

Fixed points

Identity:
$$(\Sigma_{F}(p) \ \rho(p) = F(p) \ \Sigma_{\rho}(p) \text{ i.e. "gain = loss"})$$
$$i\Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\tilde{\phi}}(p) \left[\Gamma_{\phi\tilde{\phi}}^{-1}(p) - \Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\phi}^{-1}(p)\right] = -i\Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\phi}^{-1}(p)\Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\tilde{\phi}}(p)\Gamma_{\phi\tilde{\phi}}^{-1}(p) \left[\Gamma_{\phi\tilde{\phi}}(p) - \Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\phi}(p)\right]$$

Integrating the RG equations with above approximations yields:

$$i\Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\tilde{\phi}}(p) \equiv \Sigma_{F}(p) = -\frac{\lambda}{18} \int_{q,l} \lambda_{\text{eff}}(p-q) F(p-q-l)F(q)F(l)$$

$$\Gamma_{\phi\tilde{\phi}}(p) - \Gamma_{\tilde{\phi}\phi}(p) \equiv \Sigma_{\rho}(p) = -\frac{\lambda}{18} \int_{q,l} \lambda_{\text{eff}}(p-q) \left[\rho(p-q-l)F(q)F(l) + F(p-q-l)\rho(q)F(l) + F(p-q-l)\rho(q)F(l) + F(p-q-l)F(q)\rho(l) \right]$$

infrared scaling solutions: $(z = 1, \eta = 0)$

$$F(p) = s^{2+\alpha} F(sp)$$

$$\rho(p) = s^2 \rho(sp)$$

$$\lambda_{\text{eff}}(p) = s^{\gamma} \lambda_{\text{eff}}(sp)$$

$$\gamma = -2\alpha$$

 \Rightarrow

$$\alpha = 0, \, \alpha = 1, \, \alpha = 4, \, \alpha = 5$$

vacuum thermal non-thermal

Applications

I) Early universe inflaton preheating dynamics



fast: Nonlinear: occupation numbers < $1/\lambda$ Slow: Nonperturbative: saturated occupation numbers ~ $1/\lambda$ \rightarrow all processes O(1)

Intermediate-time behavior



Well characterized by non-thermal fixed point!

UV: α = 3/2 coincides with perturbative (Boltzmann) analysis exponent Micha, Tkachev '04

Critical slowing down delays thermalization:

 T_{reheat} > 10MeV (BBN!) difficult to achieve in simple inflaton models

Non-thermal fixed points from large class of nonequilibrium instabilities



II) Fermion instability dynamics

SU(2)×SU(2) Yukawa theory after a *quench* (2PI 1/N to NLO):

with Pruschke, Rothkopf



• fermionic instability induced via boson-fermion loop:



• no IR fixed point for fermions (Pauli principle); IR bosons unaffected

• UV scaling regime, where $\lambda_{\text{eff}}\sim\lambda$:





III) Non-Abelian gauge theory dynamics

c) Plasma (Chromo-Weibel) instability:

classical-statistical SU(2) pure gauge theory in 3+1d (initial anisotropy)





III) Non-Abelian gauge theory dynamics

c) Plasma (Chromo-Weibel) instability:

classical-statistical SU(2) pure gauge theory in 3+1d (initial anisotropy)





Conclusions: Universality far from equilibrium

Nonequilibrium theories can exhibt new infrared fixed points

- characterized by strongly enhanced infrared fluctuations ($\alpha = 4$!)
- approached from substantial class of initial conditions (no fine tuning!)
- subleading quantum corrections lead to asymptotic late-time thermalization



thermal equilibrium

Role of quantum fluctuations

Non-thermal fixed point unstable under inclusion of quantum corrections

⇒ late-time thermalization to Bose-Einstein/Fermi-Dirac distributions

Thermalization example:

 $SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R$ fermionic model coupled to N=4 inflaton

Mode temperature'
$$T_p$$
: $\left(n_p \sim \text{tr} \frac{p^i \gamma^i}{p} \langle [\psi, \bar{\psi}] \rangle_p \right)$





Emergence of BE/FD distribution with

$$T_p^{(f)}(t) = T_p^{(s)}(t) = T_{\text{eq}}$$

Berges, Borsányi, Serreau, NPB 660 (2003) 51

Nonequilibrium instabilities

Large class of possible instabilities:

Spinodal, Parametric, Plasma (Weibel) ...

E.g. Weibel instability in electrodynamics: Initial fluctuating current:

 $\mathbf{j}(\mathbf{x}) = \mathbf{j} \cos(\mathbf{k}\mathbf{x}) \mathbf{e}_{\mathbf{z}}$

 \Rightarrow generated magnetic field:

 $\mathbf{B}(\mathbf{x}) = j \sin(\mathbf{k}\mathbf{x})/\mathbf{k} \mathbf{e}_{\mathbf{y}}$

⇒ Lorentz force acts such that current grows: $F(x) = q v \times B = -q v_z j sin(kx)/k e_x$

 \Rightarrow B-field grows, etc.



Fast isotropization/thermalization due to instabilities?

Mrowczynski '94; Romatschke, Strickland '03; Arnold, Lenaghan, Moore '03, Mrowczynski, Rebhan, Strickland '04; Rebhan, Romatschke, Strickland '05; Dumitru, Nara '05; Romatschke, Venugopalan '06; Schenke, Strickland, Greiner, Thoma '06; Dumitru, Nara, Strickland '07; Bödeker, Rummukainen '07; Berges, Scheffler, Sexty '08; Mrowczynski '08 ...

Characteristic time scales

- A) 'Soft' classical gauge fields + 'hard' classical particles Arnold, Moore, Yaffe; Rebhan, Romatschke, Strickland; Dumitru, Nara, Strickland; Bödeker, Rummukainen
- B) Classical-statistical gauge field evolution (here) Romatschke, Venugopalan; Berges, Scheffler, Sexty



Inverse primary growth rate:

 $\Rightarrow 1/\gamma_{max} \simeq 1.1 \text{ fm/c} \text{ for } \varepsilon = 30 \text{ GeV/fm}^3$ What energy density would be required to get $1/\gamma_{max} \simeq 0.1 \text{ fm/c}$? $\Rightarrow \varepsilon = 300 \text{ TeV/fm}^3 (!)$

Bottom-up isotropization of pressure

Spatial Fourier transform of the energy-momentum tensor $T^{\mu\nu}(x)$: $P_{L}(t,p)$ for $\mu=\nu=3$, $P_{T}(t,p)$ from transversal components



For what p is $P_L(p)/P_T(p) \gtrsim 0.6$ at end of exponential growth? $\Rightarrow p_z \lesssim 1.4 \epsilon^{1/4}$

 $p_z \lesssim 1 \text{ GeV}$ for $\varepsilon = 30 \text{ GeV/fm}^3$ 'enough' for hydro?

BUT: Isotropization time of dominant higher momenta consistent with 'infinity'

time evolution nonperturbative regime: ${\sim}N^{\,0}$ $\sim N, N^0$ (IV) $\sim O(\lambda^{-1})$ quasistationary $t_{\rm nonpert} \sim \ln (\lambda^{-1})/2 \gamma_0$ $\sim {\rm O}({\rm N}^{\,0}\lambda^0)$ $F_{I} \sim O(N^{0} \lambda^{-1})$ source induced amplification (III) ${\rm O}({\rm N}^0\lambda^0)$ $t_{collect} \sim 2 t_{nonpert}/3 + \ln(N)/6\gamma_0$ $F_{\rm I} \sim O(N^{1/3} \lambda^{-2/3})$ for $N \lesssim \lambda^{-1}$ rate: $6 \gamma_0$ for $F_{\perp} (p \neq p_0)$ nonlinear regime: (II) $\sim O(N^0 \lambda^0)$ $t_{source} \sim t_{nonpert}/2$ $F_{\!\!\perp} \sim O(N^0 \, \lambda^{-1/2})$ rate: $4 \gamma_0$ for $F_{\parallel} (p \leq 2p_0)$ parametric resonance (I) linear regime: rate: 2 γ_0 $F_{\perp}(t,t;p_0) \sim \exp(2\gamma_0 t)$

Slow

Nonperturbative: saturated occupation numbers $\sim 1/\lambda$ \rightarrow *universal:* λ drops out \rightarrow all processes O(1)Effective weak coupling!

fast

Nonlinear – perturbative: occupation numbers < $1/\lambda$

secondary growth rates $c(2\gamma_0)$ with c = 2, 3, ...

Classical/linear: primary growth rate

t=0, $F_{\rm I}\sim O(N^0 \lambda^0)$

 $\phi \sim ({
m N}$ / λ)^{1/2}

Comparison quantum/classical dynamics

Classical-statistical simulations: Khlebnikov, Tkachev '96; Prokopec, Roos '97; Tkachev, Khlebnikov, Kofman, Linde '98; ...



Practically no quantum corrections at the end of preheating

Accurate nonperturbative description by 2PI 1/N to NLO

Nonequilibrium evolution equations

Propagator:spectral function ~
$$\langle [\Phi, \Phi] \rangle$$
 $G(x, y) = F(x, y) - \frac{i}{2}\rho(x, y) \operatorname{sign}_{\mathscr{C}}(x^0 - y^0)$ statistical propagator ~ $\langle \{\Phi, \Phi\} \rangle$

Tremendous simplification if thermal equilibrium $G^{(eq)}(x,y)=G^{(eq)}(x-y)$ with $F^{(eq)}(\omega,\mathbf{p}) = -i\left(\frac{1}{2}+n_{BE}(\omega)\right)\rho^{(eq)}(\omega,\mathbf{p})$ "fluctuation-dissipation relation"

Nonequilibrium:

 $F \not\sim \rho$

$$\begin{bmatrix} \Box_x \delta_{ac} + M_{ac}^2(x) \end{bmatrix} \rho_{cb}(x, y) = -\int_{y^0}^{x^0} dz \Sigma_{ac}^{\rho}(x, z) \rho_{cb}(z, y)$$
$$\begin{bmatrix} \Box_x \delta_{ac} + M_{ac}^2(x) \end{bmatrix} F_{cb}(x, y) = -\int_0^{x^0} dz \Sigma_{ac}^{\rho}(x, z) F_{cb}(z, y)$$
$$+ \int_0^{y^0} dz \Sigma_{ac}^{F}(x, z) \rho_{cb}(z, y)$$
$$\left(\left[\Box_x + \frac{\lambda}{6N} \phi^2(x) \right] \delta_{ab} + M_{ab}^2(x; \phi = 0, F) \right) \phi_b(x)$$
$$= -\int_0^{x^0} dy \Sigma_{ab}^{\rho}(x, y; \phi = 0, F, \rho) \phi_b(y)$$

Quantum- vs. classical-statistical contributions

(Similar for 1/*N* to NLO and $\phi \neq 0$) Example: Quantum $\Sigma^{F}(t,t';\mathbf{p}) = -\frac{\lambda^{2}}{6} \int_{\mathbf{q},\mathbf{k}} F(t,t';\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{q}-\mathbf{k})$ $\left|F(t,t';\mathbf{q})F(t,t';\mathbf{k}) - \frac{3}{4}\rho(t,t';\mathbf{q})\rho(t,t';\mathbf{k})\right|$ $\Sigma^{\rho}(t,t';\mathbf{p}) = -\frac{\lambda^2}{2} \int_{\mathbf{C},\mathbf{k}} \rho(t,t';\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{q}-\mathbf{k})$ $\left|F(t,t';\mathbf{q})F(t,t';\mathbf{k}) - \frac{1}{12}\rho(t,t';\mathbf{q})\rho(t,t';\mathbf{k})\right|$ Classical $\Sigma_{\rm cl}^F(t,t';\mathbf{p}) = -\frac{\lambda^2}{6} \int_{\mathbf{q},\mathbf{k}} F(t,t';\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{q}-\mathbf{k}) F(t,t';\mathbf{q}) F(t,t';\mathbf{k})$ $\Sigma_{\rm cl}^{\rho}(t,t';\mathbf{p}) = -\frac{\lambda^2}{2} \int_{\mathbf{r},\mathbf{k}} \rho(t,t';\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{q}-\mathbf{k}) F(t,t';\mathbf{q}) F(t,t';\mathbf{k})$

Effective coupling Graphically: ω=0.52 10⁰ ω=0.39 ω=0.26 $\lambda_{\text{eff}} \; (\omega, \mathsf{p}) / \lambda$ $\frac{\lambda}{\left|1+\Pi_R(p)\right|^2}$ $\lambda_{\text{eff}}(p) =$ 10⁻¹ $\omega = 0.13$ nonperturbative ω=0.03 regime (t=240) 0.1 1 р

'One-loop' retarded self-energy:

$$\Pi_R(p) = \frac{\lambda}{3(2\pi)^4} \int d^4q \, F(q) G_R(p-q) \quad ; \quad \Delta(\phi,p) = \frac{2\lambda\phi^2}{3N} \operatorname{Re}[\frac{G_R(p)}{1+\Pi_R(p)}]$$

Fixed point condition

Time and space translation invariant solutions require:

$$\Sigma_{ab}^{\rho}(\phi, p)F_{bc}(p) - \Sigma_{ab}^{F}(\phi, p)\rho_{bc}(p) = J_{ac}^{(3)}(\phi, p) + J_{ac}^{(4)}(\phi, p) \equiv \mathbf{0}$$

Neglecting quantum corrections and $F_{ab} \sim \delta_{ab} F$, $\rho_{ab} \sim \delta_{ab} \rho$, 1/N to NLO:

$$J_{aa}^{(3)}(\phi, p) = \frac{\lambda \phi^2}{18N(2\pi)^4} \int d^4k \, d^4q \, \delta^4(p - q - k) \\ [\lambda_{\text{eff}}(k) + \lambda_{\text{eff}}(q) + \lambda_{\text{eff}}(p)] [\rho(k)F(q)F(p) \\ + F(k)\rho(q)F(p) - F(k)F(q)\rho(p)]$$

$$J_{aa}^{(4)}(\phi, p) = \frac{\lambda}{18(2\pi)^8} \int d^4k \, d^4q \, d^4r \, \delta^4(p + k - q - r) \\ \lambda_{\text{eff}}(p + k) \Big\{ [F(p)\rho(k) + \rho(p)F(k)]F(q)F(r) \\ \times (1-\Delta(\phi)) \Big\} \Big\}$$

 $-F(p)F(k)[F(q)\rho(r) + \rho(q)F(r)] \Big\}$

 $(1 - \Delta(\phi, p))$

Berges, Rothkopf, Schmidt '08

Scaling solutions

$$F(p) = s^{2+\alpha} F(sp)$$

$$\rho(p) = s^2 \rho(sp)$$

$$\lambda_{\text{eff}}(p) = s^{\gamma} \lambda_{\text{eff}}(sp)$$

 $\Rightarrow \Pi_R(p) = s^{\alpha} \Pi_R(sp)$, i.e. λ_{eff} scales differently in UV and IR:

I: $\gamma = 0 \text{ for } \Pi_R(p) \ll 1$ (UV) $J_{aa}^{(3)}(\phi, p) = s^{2\alpha} J_{aa}^{(3)}(s\phi, sp) \leftarrow \text{dominates UV for } \alpha > 0$ $J_{aa}^{(4)}(0, p) = s^{3\alpha} J_{aa}^{(4)}(0, sp) \qquad J_{aa}^{(3)}(\phi, p) = 0 \Rightarrow \alpha = 1, \ \alpha = \frac{3}{2}$

$$\begin{split} \text{II}: \quad \gamma &= -2\alpha \ \text{ for } \ \Pi_R(p) \gg 1 \quad \text{(IR)} \\ J^{(3)}_{aa}(\phi,p) &= \ s^0 \ J^{(3)}_{aa}(s\phi,sp) \\ J^{(4)}_{aa}(0,p) &= \ s^\alpha \ J^{(4)}_{aa}(0,sp) \quad \leftarrow \text{ dominates IR for } \alpha > 0 \\ J^{(4)}_{aa}(0,p) &= 0 \ \Rightarrow \boxed{\alpha = 0, \ \alpha = 1, \ \alpha = 4, \ \alpha = 5} \end{split}$$